A Strategic Plan to Reduce Vehicle-Animal Accidents in Northeast Ohio

June 2009

Prepared by the Northeast Ohio Areawide Coordinating Agency

NOACA
Planning For Greater Cleveland
The Northeast Ohio Areawide Coordinating Agency (NOACA) is a public organization serving the counties of and municipalities and townships within Cuyahoga, Geauga, Lake, Lorain and Medina (covering an area with 2.1 million people). NOACA is the agency designated or recognized to perform the following functions:

- Serve as the Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO), with responsibility for comprehensive, cooperative and continuous planning for highways, public transit, and bikeways, as defined in the current transportation law.
- Perform continuous water quality, transportation-related air quality and other environmental planning functions.
- Administer the area clearinghouse function, which includes providing local government with the opportunity to review a wide variety of local or state applications for federal funds.
- Conduct transportation and environmental planning and related demographic, economic and land use research.
- Serve as an information center for transportation and environmental and related planning.
- At NOACA Governing Board direction, provide transportation and environmental planning assistance to the 172 units of local, general purpose government.

The NOACA Governing Board is composed of 38 local public officials. The Board convenes monthly to provide a forum for members to present, discuss and develop solutions to local and areawide issues and make recommendations regarding implementation strategies. As the area clearinghouse for the region, the Board makes comments and recommendations on applications for state and federal grants, with the purpose of enhancing the region’s social, physical, environmental and land use/transportation fabric.

NOACA invites you to take part in its planning process. Feel free to participate, to ask questions and to learn more about areawide planning.

For more information, call: (216) 241-2414 or log on at: http://www.noaca
2009 NOACA BOARD & COMMITTEES

BOARD OFFICERS

**President:** William M. Grace, Mayor, City of Elyria  
**First Vice-President:** James R. Gills, P.E., P.S., Lake County Engineer  
**Second Vice President:** Peter Lawson Jones, Cuyahoga County Commissioner  
**Secretary:** Stephen D. Hambley, President, Medina County Board of Commissioners  
**Assistant Secretary:** Betty C. Blair, Lorain County Commissioner  

**Treasurer:** Frank G. Jackson, Mayor, City of Cleveland  
**Assistant Treasurer:** Julius Ciaccia, Jr., Executive Director, Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District  
**Assistant Treasurer:** Robert E. Afuldish, Lake County Commissioner  
**Immediate Past President:** Mary E. Samide, Geauga County Commissioner

CUYAHOGA COUNTY

Robert G. Blomquist, Mayor, City of Olmsted Falls  
Scott E. Coleman, Mayor, City of Highland Heights  
Jimmy Dimora, Cuyahoga County Commissioner  
Robert C. Downey, City Manager, Cleveland Heights  
Timothy Hagan, President, Cuyahoga County Board of Commissioners  
Peter Lawson Jones, Cuyahoga County Commissioner  
Robert C. Downey, City Manager, Cleveland Heights  
Timothy Hagan, President, Cuyahoga County Board of Commissioners  
Peter Lawson Jones, Cuyahoga County Commissioner  
Robert C. Kleiber, Jr., P.S., P.S., Cuyahoga County Engineer  
Thomas O’Grady, Mayor, City of North Olmsted  
Kevin C. Patton, Mayor, City of Solon  
Michael S. Procek, Mayor, Village of Brooklyn Heights  
Robert A. Stefanik, Mayor, City of North Royalton  

CITY OF CLEVELAND

Anthony Brancatelli, Councilman, City of Cleveland  

ROBERT N. BROWN, Director of Planning  
FRANK G. JACKSON, Mayor  
MARTIN KEANE, Councilman  
MAMIE MITCHELL, Councilman  
JOMARIE WASIK, Director of Public Services  

GEAUGA COUNTY

Tracy A. Jemison, Geauga County Commissioner  
Mary E. Samide, Geauga County Commissioner  
William S. Young, President, Geauga County Board of Commissioners  

LAKE COUNTY

Robert E. Afuldish, Lake County Commissioner  
James R. Gills, P.E., P.S., Lake County Engineer  
Raymond E. Sines, Lake County Commissioner  
Daniel P. Troy, President, Lake County Board of Commissioners  
Mark A. Tyler, Mayor, City of Kirtland  

LORAIN COUNTY

Betty C. Blair, Lorain County Commissioner  
Kenneth P. Carney, Sr., P.E., P.S. Lorain County Engineer  
William M. Grace, Mayor, City of Elyria  
Ted Kalo, Lorain County Commissioner  
Anthony M. Krasienko, Mayor, City of Lorain  

NON VOTING MEMBERS:

Lyn Luttner, Manager, Cleveland Office, US EPA  
William T. Skowronski, Chief, Northeast District Office, Ohio Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)

ENVIRONMENTAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE

**Chairperson:** Mary E. Samide, Geauga County Commissioner  

**Air Quality Subcommittee Chair:** Rich Nemeth, Cleveland Commissioner, Division of Air Quality  
**Water Quality Subcommittee Chair:** Kenneth P. Carney, Sr., P.E., P.S., Lorain County Engineer  

**CUYAHOGA COUNTY**

Terry Allen, Cuyahoga County Health Commissioner  
Anthony Brancatelli, Councilman, City of Cleveland  
Matthew Carroll, Interim Director, Cleveland Public Health  
Julius Ciaccia, Jr., Executive Director, NEORSD

**GEAUGA COUNTY**

Mary E. Samide, Geauga County Commissioner

**LAKE COUNTY**

Robert E. Afuldish, Lake County Commissioner  
James R. Gills, P.E., P.S., Lake County Engineer  
Frank Kellogg, Director, Lake County Environmental Health (representing Local Air Agencies)

**MEDINA COUNTY**

Chris Easton, Director of Public Service, City of Wadsworth  
Stephen D. Hambley, President, Medina County Board of Commissioners  
Kathleen Scheutzow, Trustee, Brunswick Hills

**NORTHEAST OHIO REGIONAL SEWER DISTRICT (NEORSD)**

Julius Ciaccia, Jr., Executive Director  
George M. Dixon, President, Board of Trustees  
OHDGO DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION (ODOT)  
Bonita G. Tieuwen, P.E., Deputy Director, ODOT  
District 12  
Ex officio Member: William T. Skowronski, Chief, Northeast District Office, Ohio Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)
2009 NOACA BOARD & COMMITTEES

PLANNING ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Chairperson: Robert N. Brown, Cleveland Planning Commission

Paul A. Alsenas, Director, Cuyahoga County Planning Commission
Jason Boyd, Director, Lake County Planning Commission
Robert N. Brown, Director, Cleveland Planning Commission
David Dietrich, Director, Geauga County Planning Commission
Patrice Theken, Director, Medina County Planning Commission
(vacant) Director, Lorain County Planning Commission

TRANSPORTATION ADVISORY COMMITTEE
Chairperson: James R. Gills, P.E., P.S., Lake County Engineer

CUYAHOGA COUNTY
Paul A. Alsenas, Director, Cuyahoga County Planning Commission
Robert N. Brown, Director, Cleveland Planning Commission
Joseph A. Calabrese, General Manager, GCRTA
(vacant) Commissioner, Cleveland Department of Engineering & Construction
Jimmy Dimora, Cuyahoga County Commissioner
Robert C. Downey, City Manager, City of Cleveland Heights
Timothy Hagan, Cuyahoga County Commissioner
Martin Keane, Councilman, City of Cleveland
Robert C. Klaiber, Jr., P.E., P.S., Cuyahoga County Engineer
Rob Mavec, Commissioner, Cleveland Traffic Engineering
Kevin C. Patton, Mayor, City of Solon

LAKE COUNTY
Robert E. Aulfudish, Lake County Commissioner
Jason Boyd, Director, Lake County Planning Commission
James R. Gills, P.E., P.S., Lake County Engineer
Raymond Jurkowski, General Manager, Laketran
Daniel P. Troy, Lake County Commissioner

GEauga COUNTY
David Dietrich, Director, Geauga County Planning Commission
Robert L. Phillips, P.E., Geauga County Engineer
Kristina Reider, Director, Geauga County Transit
Mary E. Samide, Geauga County Commissioner
William T. Skowronski, Chief, Northeast District Office Ohio EPA

LORaIN COUNTY
Betty C. Blair, Lorain County Commissioner
Kenneth P. Carney, Sr., P.E., P.S., Lorain County Engineer
Chris Easton, Director of Public Service, City of Wadsworth
Richard Enty, Interim General Manager, Lorain County Transit
Ted Kalo, Lorain County Commissioner
(vacant) Director, Lorain County Planning Commission

MEDINA COUNTY
Stephen D. Hambley, Medina County Commissioner
Michael Salamone, Director, Medina County Transit
Michael Salay, P.E., Medina County Engineer
Patrice Theken, Director, Medina County Planning Commission
Adam Wasserman, Cleveland Cuyahoga County Port Authority

OTHER VOTING MEMBERS: ODOT District Deputy Directors:
Bonita G. Tieuwen, P.E., (ODOT 12)
John Hart (ODOT 3)

NOACA DIRECTORS
Howard R. Maier, FAICP, Executive Director
Stephen E. DeJohn, Esq., Director, Legal Counsel
Cheryl A. Kurkowski, CPA, Director of Finance & Operations
Planning and Programs Division Directors:
Ronald T. Eckner, P. E., Director of Planning
John Hosek, Director of Programs
Planning and Programs Division Associate Directors:
Bill Davis, Associate Director of Planning
Steve Jones, Associate Director of Divisional Services

NON VOTING MEMBERS:
James Cardina, Fairport Harbor Port Authority
Dennis A. Decker, FHWA Ohio Division Administrator
Ricky D. Smith, Director, Cleveland Department of Port Control, Cleveland Hopkins International Airport
Ernest Gubry, Federal Aviation Administration
Richard Novak, Executive Director, Lorain County Port Authority
Gary Suhadolnik, Executive Director, Ohio Turnpike Commission
Adam Wasserman, Cleveland Cuyahoga County Port Authority
# A Strategic Plan to Reduce Vehicle-Animal Accidents in Northeast Ohio

## Author(s):
- James W. Armaline, Senior Planning Engineer
- Gary Grano, Senior Planner
- Corridor Planning Team
- Regional Transportation System Team
- Gayle L. Godek (Layout Design)

## Report Date
- June 2009

## Performing Organization Name & Address
- Northeast Ohio Areawide Coordinating Agency
  - 1299 Superior Avenue, Cleveland, OH 44114-3204
  - Phone: (216) 241-2414, FAX: (216) 621-3024, Web site: www.noaca.org

## Sponsoring Agency Name & Address
- Ohio Department of Transportation
  - 1980 W. Broad St., Box 899, Columbus, OH 43216-0899

## Type of Report & Period Covered
- July 1, 2008 to June 30, 2009

## Abstracts
According to a 2004-2005 insurance claims statistic study, Ohio was the fourth highest state in vehicle-deer crashes causing, in many cases, death to humans and deer. The transportation system has become a barrier to the safe movement of wildlife and companion animals, or pets, in urban, suburban, exurban and rural settings. This report proposes that NOACA partner with the Federal Highway Administration and the park systems to develop and implement a strategy to provide for safe movement of people and animals within Northeast Ohio.

## Key Words & Document Analysis

### Descriptors
- Wildlife, Accidents, Safety, Deer

### Identifiers/Open Ended Terms
- Wildlife, Accidents, Safety, Deer
A Strategic Plan to Reduce Vehicle-Animal Accidents in Northeast Ohio

“The Lesson To Be Learned From Fragmented, Isolated Habitats Is Yeatsian: Things Fall Apart”

June 2009

Prepared by

NORTHEAST OHIO AREAWIDE COORDINATING AGENCY

Principal Author: James W. Armaline, Senior Planning Engineer

Special Contribution — Data and Graphics: Gary Grano, Senior Planner

Other Contributors: Corridor Planning Team
Regional Transportation System Team
Gayle L. Godek (Layout Design)

WILLIAM M. GRACE
BOARD PRESIDENT

HOWARD R. MAIER, FAICP
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

The preparation of this publication was financed through grants received from the Federal Highway Administration and the Ohio Department of Transportation and appropriations from the counties of and municipalities within Cuyahoga, Geauga, Lake, Lorain and Medina. The contents do not necessarily reflect official views or policies of the U.S. Department of Transportation or the Ohio Department of Transportation. This report does not constitute a standard or regulation.

# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. National Problem</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. National Response</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Regional Landscape</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Regional Response</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Implementation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
National Problem

The National Highway Traffic Safety Administration reports 1.5 million deer-related accidents annually on our nation’s roadways. The human toll is approximately 150 dead and 10,000 injured. Vehicular damage is estimated to be 1 billion. No value is placed on wildlife, in this case deer. This is a conservative estimate due to no national standard for reporting vehicle-deer crashes.\(^1\)

Ohio was the fourth highest state in vehicle-deer crashes according to a 2004-2005 insurance claims statistic study. Only Pennsylvania, Michigan and Illinois had more vehicle-deer crashes than Ohio. The peak period for these accidents is between October and December due to deer migration and mating.

National Response

Road planners, designers, builders, and operators give minimal thought to wildlife habitat destruction and fragmentation in the placement, design and use of infrastructure. The transportation system has become a barrier to the safe movement of wildlife and companion animals, or pets, in urban, suburban, exurban and rural settings. The response to this problem must begin with an understanding of human and animal behavior within these ecosystems. Paul A. Garrett and Fred G. Bank first offered an approach to this challenge in a paper presented to the Standing Committee on the Environment at the annual meeting of the American Association of State Highway and Transportation Officials in October 1995 entitled “The Ecosystem Approach and Transportation Development.”\(^2\)


As a result of the trip, the team formed conclusions and recommendations for U.S. applications in the areas of policy, communications, guidance manuals, and research. In particular, the group recommends:

1. including wildlife/transportation issues in the FHWA and AASHTO strategic plans;
2. creating a central source of contact for international exchange of information;
3. developing a number of guidance manuals pertaining to assessment methodologies, interagency coordination, terminology, and structures design;
4. using pooled funds to study connectivity needs for all types of wildlife; and
5. funding a national connectivity study.


---


\(^2\) Fred G. Bank and Paul A. Garrett attached to the Federal Highway Administration Office of Environment and Planning Environmental Analysis Division in Washington D.C during the 1990s.
Regional Landscape

In SFY2009 NOACA embarked on a regional effort to provide for safer movement of people and animals within the region. This report is designed to provide an impetus and direction for this effort. Similar efforts are under way in the northwest and have been well-established in other parts of the world.

The concept has been introduced in southern Ohio as part of the U.S. 33 Nelsonville Bypass Project, but this unique initiative is a first for our region. There is a growing toolbox of effective measures to employ, from light and sound technology to under- and overpasses.

The table below and the map that follows on page three provide the Greater Cleveland five-county regional scale and distribution of the problem.

During the years 2005-2007, Lorain and Cuyahoga counties had the first and second highest numbers of animal-related crashes with 1,557 and 1,438 crashes, respectively, while Geauga and Medina Counties led in percent of total crashes with 17.51 percent and 10.81 percent, respectively, according to ODOT-released crash data.

Approximately 87 percent of animal-related crashes in the ODOT released crash data had x and y coordinates allowing them to be mapped. The crashes cluster along major arterials that connect or are in proximity to park areas, in contrast to national data that reveals concentrations on two-laned, low-volume, low-speed roadways as the more likely locations for vehicle-animal crashes. The animals involved are predominantly deer.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Animal-Related Accidents</th>
<th>Total Accidents</th>
<th>Percent Animal Related</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cuyahoga</td>
<td>1,438</td>
<td>105,676</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geauga</td>
<td>1,284</td>
<td>7,218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lake</td>
<td>829</td>
<td>18,354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lorain</td>
<td>1,557</td>
<td>22,042</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medina</td>
<td>1,238</td>
<td>11,429</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOACA Total</td>
<td>6,324</td>
<td>164,719</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Regional Response

Drawing on best management practices gleaned from national and international sources, NOACA staff is developing a multidisciplinary and multijurisdictional hierarchical approach that proceeds from habitat creation, protection, and restoration and proceeds through discouragement and detection.

Some aspects of this approach may include land banking, conservation, sustainable development, wildlife underpasses and overpasses, detection and warning devices, fencing, plantings and combinations thereof. These techniques and devices may be employed in all ecosystems to avoid crashes with a variety of creatures, including pets and small mammals. Most of these crashes go unreported because they don’t involve driver injury or vehicle damage and no monetary value is placed on non-human animals. Deer-involved crashes make up the bulk of those reported, with farm and other animal categories making up the difference. Implementation will require a multijurisdictional and multidisciplined effort led by NOACA and its partners.

Staff has already introduced ecosystem-based transportation planning concepts into project reviews and corridor studies concerning watershed and water quality issues over the past several years. This past year, reducing wildlife collisions was a recommended component of one of the agency’s Road Safety Audits (RSAs). Reducing vehicle-wildlife crashes has become a stand-alone effort according to its recent transportation plan update.
Implementation

A recent Transportation Research Board (TRB) Webinar provided a unique learning experience for those concerned about the complex problem of vehicle-wildlife crashes and some thoughtful responses to it. The speakers, Mary Gray of FHWA and Patrick McGowen & Marcel Huijser of the Western Transportation Institute at Montana State University offered insights into the problem and possible solutions that reflect the multidisciplinary and context-driven orientation necessary to reduce the likelihood of animal-vehicle crashes. Responses to the problem include methods to prevent, minimize and mitigate vehicle-animal crashes.

A successful strategy is connected to an understanding of how people and animals interact within ecosystems, especially large animals (wildlife) that travel in herds, i.e., deer in northeast Ohio. Basic questions to answer are where the primary habitats are and what the migration patterns are between those habitats. Naturalists understand wildlife travel, and transportation planners understand human travel. Through collaboration these professionals can avoid cross-species path crossings. A strategy to prevent, minimize or mitigate wildlife-vehicle crashes would include:

- Identifying habitat with significant concentrations of wildlife in the region;
- Preserving and conserving existing wildlife habitat within all types of ecosystems, i.e., rural, suburban, park systems, and urban;
- Augmenting existing habitat through creative use of land banking and other techniques designed to keep wildlife areas wild;
- When necessary locating new transportation infrastructure and related development such that it does not fragment or encroach on existing wildlife habitat;
- When habitat fragmentation by vital new infrastructure cannot be avoided, incorporating long tunnels or bridges into the design;
- When reconstructing or rehabilitating transportation infrastructure retrofit to reconnect terrestrial or aquatic habitat using existing underpasses and overpasses, along with detection equipment, fencing, plantings and combinations thereof;
- Monitoring wildlife use of over- and underpasses using infrared technology and vehicle-wildlife crash statistics to measure the effectiveness of these strategies throughout the region.


To be successful at reducing vehicle-wildlife crashes in the region, NOACA must continue to weave ecosystem consciousness into the transportation planning process as described above in concert with its partners. That is, creating, restoring, and reconnecting habitat and using Intelligent Transportation System technology on high-crash roadways. Next steps for SFY 2010 and beyond include:

- Evaluating crash data for 2008;
- Identifying and prioritizing roadway segments in the region with respect to vehicle-wildlife crashes per mile and crash severity;
- Introducing wildlife detection technology into the ITS strategic plan during the next update;
- Assisting the Ohio Turnpike Commission in the implementation of animal detection devices along high-accident segments as available turnpike revenues permit;
- Monitoring crashes along the newly constructed segment of Crocker Road that encroaches on Bradley Reservation habitat;
- Establishing or reestablishing a wildlife corridor where habitat has been fragmented by infrastructure.

3 TRB Webinar: Animal Vehicle Crashes, May 12, 2009 @ 2:00 pm EDT.